

**CITY OF ORINDA
CITIZENS' INFRASTRUCTURE OVERSIGHT COMMISSION
MINUTES**

Wednesday, July 10, 2019

A REGULAR MEETING OF THE CITIZENS' INFRASTRUCTURE OVERSIGHT COMMISSION (CIOC) WAS HELD ON THE ABOVE DATE IN THE SARGE LITTLEHALE COMMUNITY ROOM, 22 ORINDA WAY, ORINDA, CALIFORNIA

A. CALL TO ORDER

Chair Hammon called the meeting to order at 6:30 p.m.

The following documents were provided at this meeting:

1. *2018 Roads and Drainage Repairs Plan - Draft Summary - Orinda Public Road Conditions* – by Chair Hammon, dated July 10, 2019
2. *City of Orinda Culvert Prioritization List - Original Weighting Scores from Scope --* by Drake Haglan and Associates, dated July 10, 2019
3. *City of Orinda Culvert Prioritization List – Revised Weighting Scores* – by Drake Hagland and Associates, dated July 10, 2019
4. *Public Project List - Schaaf & Wheeler 2016* - Compiled by City Staff, dated July 10, 2019
5. *Management Report on Infrastructure – Rehabilitation of Orinda's Major Public Roads: Objectives, Expenditures, and Results to Date (2007 to 2020 Projected) Preliminary Draft* – by Commissioners Condon, Murphy, and Nelson, dated July 8, 2019

B. ROLL CALL

COMMISSIONERS: Walter Bell, Jerry Condon, (absent, excused) Chris Decareau, Jud Hammon, Bill Hurrell, Terry Murphy, Commissioner Nelson (absent, excused)

City Staff: Paving Program Project Manager Farah Khorashadi, Senior Engineer Scott Christie

C. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE – led by Chair Hammon

D. ADOPTION OF AGENDA

MOTION: By Commissioner Murphy, seconded by Commissioner Bell, to adopt the agenda. The motion carried by unanimous voice vote.

E. PUBLIC FORUM – None

F. CITIZENS' INFRASTRUCTURE OVERSIGHT COMMISSION MEETING MINUTES

Approval of CIOC Meeting Minutes of June 12, 2019

MOTION: By Commissioner Murphy, seconded by Commissioner Hurrell, to approve the meeting minutes of June 12, 2019. The motion carried by unanimous voice vote.

G. DISCUSSION – 2018 ROAD AND DRAINAGE REPAIRS PLAN STATUS AND NEXT STEPS - SUB-COMMITTEE PROGRESS REPORT

Chair Hammon advised that he had met with Commissioner Hurrell to work on the Plan and distributed *2018 Roads and Drainage Repairs Plan - Draft Summary - Orinda Public Road Conditions*; his goal is to create a consensus regarding the funding needed to meet the long term objectives of maintaining the roads and drainage systems. He read an e-mail, dated June 29, 2019, from Commissioner Nelson, which read, in part:

“...This analysis looks very good to me. It would be nice to ask how much would be required to hold the number of poor and failed roads at zero. Somewhere between ½ and ¾ of one percent. But we can work at this, but the City Council will have to decide what to test in the poll. I think a ¾ of one percent sales tax would be more likely than 1 percent. Alternatively, if we go to 1 percent, it would be useful to know how much would be left over to use, say, for the drains, and how this might be applied to fix the drains over time – not all at once, but so many per year, prioritized by current condition or potential damage to the community. I think Farah could go back to the consultant who prepared the PTAP to do runs at 0.6%, 0.7%, and 0.8%, or even ask them to do a run maintaining a minimum PCI 50. Streetsaver can do this...”

Chair Hammon also read a separate e-mail, dated July 2, 2019, from Commissioner Nelson, in which he noted that the process of road maintenance is a broad management issue which must be addressed; when restoring roads it was reasonable to use all funds as the money was available; however, that is no longer acceptable in the maintenance phase; the Plan needs to call for continuous funding that goes into a reserve for road maintenance and is expended upon need as determined by Streetsaver; the idea is that property owners should pay for the roads as they use them, not when replacement or maintenance is needed.

Commissioner Decareau stated that maintenance costs increase over time; the most important thing is requiring funding for maintenance.

Chair Hammon questioned whether they should look at alternative sales tax percentages and if they should add one, two, or three additional graphs. He noted the policy where the average PCI is at least 70 and that there should be no roads that have a PCI of less than 50. He questioned whether there should be graphs that show average PCI falling below 70 with a ½ Cent Sales Tax by 2039 and identifying roads in Good to Very Good condition (PCI 50 or higher) showing that, with a ½ Cent Sales Tax, forty percent of the roads will no longer have a PCI 50 or higher. Currently six percent of roads do not have PCI 50 or higher. By 2029, the number of Poor roads (PCI less than 50) will drop to zero

because the roads will have all been repaired; however, the number will increase again without a One Cent Sales Tax.

Commissioner Bell confirmed that graphs would be useful, but cautioned that the feature in the graphs where the lines overlap would be hard to understand; the charts do add value to the argument.

Chair Hammon suggested that the text should point out that with the ½ Cent Sales Tax expiring, the roads will start to fall into disrepair; if the ½ Cent Sales Tax is renewed, deferred maintenance will start to fall, but climb again in 2031; the only scenario that shows deferred maintenance decreasing is the One Cent Sales Tax.

Commissioner Murphy stated that to get the most value for the money, the City began with Arterials, Collectors, and Bus Routes as a way of getting major results with minimal spending. The charts would be fine with some additional verbiage; on Figure 3, it should be emphasized what the condition of the roads will be if funds are not available; it cannot be expected that the public will figure it out; there should be a number or text that explains this.

Chair Hammon concurred.

Commissioner Murphy preferred to go back to the 2014-2039 chart because it presents a better historical perspective; and adding a new chart or verbiage of comparative costs to do maintenance on a per-square yard or per-square foot basis for different types of surface treatment.

Paving Program Project Manager Khorashadi advised that this information is available in the P-TAP report.

Commissioner Bell questioned whether it would be worthwhile to have the City Council look at the Draft Plan; perhaps Vice-Mayor Gee and Councilmember Fay could read the Draft before the CIOC finalizes the Plan.

Commissioner Murphy suggested removing the last chart.

The Commissioners decided to meet with Vice-Mayor Gee and Councilmember Fay.

Senior Engineer Christie distributed comparison charts showing the Schaff and Wheeler report and how it compares to the Drake-Haglan and Associates (DHA) inspection.

Chair Hammon asked what pipes DHA looked at most recently and what the status of the Schaff and Wheeler recommendations is thus far.

Senior Engineer Christie reviewed reports from DHA, which included a summary of pipes inspected and the prioritization; DHA was hired to take a more detailed look at some of the larger diameter pipes and a few select smaller diameter pipes to get more accurate cost data. Schaff and Wheeler focused on hydraulics, capacities of the systems, alleviation of flooding, and, to a lesser extent, some larger pipes to check condition. Both had a limited group of pipes which were evaluated. DHA looked at cases that Schaff and Wheeler did not have an opportunity to inspect and prepared detailed reports and cost estimates; pipes were scored for priority on size and importance (larger pipes that fail are worse than smaller pipes that fail); pipes were then ranked in order of prioritization. There was also a revised way in which factors changed and widened scores out, increasing the total range of scores and changed the order. The Scaaf and Wheeler project list does not directly match up with the DHA list, since DHA inspected a slightly different group of pipes. Additionally, DHA did detailed cost estimates, including construction, engineering, and environmental costs, on a case by case basis. This included the cost of complying with the regulatory permits in locations which are potential fish habitats. A table with the Schaaf and Wheeler 2016 Project List was provided, showing status of the projects and which locations were also inspected by DHA; the status indicated that some projects are already complete or underway as part of the 2018 Pavement Rehabilitation Project, some are indefinitely deferred, and some are private locations which therefore should not be on the City project list.

Commissioner Bell questioned when a more refined estimate would be available for the cost of drainage repairs. The Commissioners agreed that the estimate should be completed by August and they can discuss it further at the next CIOC meeting prior to the September City Council meeting.

Commissioner Decareau recommended making a rough estimate and discussing it prior to completing a more accurate estimate.

Commissioner Murphy suggested that the current method of weighting the drains for size and risk is the best way to set the prioritization.

Chair Hammon noted that the top few pipes on both lists are the same.

Commissioner Bell and Chair Hammon questioned where risk would fall on the scoring.

Senior Engineer Christie responded that risk was incorporated into the scoring and weighted by importance, work type, and pipe diameter.

This item was continued to the next CIOC meeting.

H. DISCUSSION – DRAFT MANAGEMENT REPORT – ARTERIAL AND COLLECTOR STREETS

Commissioner Murphy presented the Draft *Management Report on Infrastructure*; this preliminary Draft describes revenues and expenditures spent on Arterials, Collectors, and Bus Routes from 2007 to the present. A report has been completed for the Residential streets; a new report is being generated for the remaining streets and will be completed when final numbers are received from the Director of Finance.

This item was continued to the next CIOC meeting.

I. STAFF UPDATES

Paving Program Project Manager Khorashadi reported on the following items:

- *Update – Public Information and Outreach – Miner Road Project - Grinding and Paving will begin July 22, 2019; notices have been posted on Nextdoor and Outlook; it is anticipated that paving will be complete by July 30, 2019; during the paving operation, the road will be closed and detours will be implemented from 8:00 a.m. to 5:00 p.m.*
- *Update – 2018 Pavement Rehabilitation Project - Bay Cities Paving and Grading is currently working on Bates Boulevard, Bates Court and Muth Drive to repair the raveling pavement.*
- *Update- 2019 Pavement Rehabilitation Project – A Notice to Proceed was issued to DeSilva Gates Construction on July 8, 2019; there are 120 working days to complete the project; the Glorietta Elementary Safe Route to School Project is included in this year’s work.*

J. MATTERS INITIATED

Items for the next CIOC Agenda:

- Discussion - 2018 Road and Drainage Repairs Plan Status and Next Steps – Sub-Committee Progress Report
- Discussion - Draft Management Report - Arterial and Collector Streets

K. ADJOURNMENT

MOTION: By Commissioner Murphy, seconded by Commissioner Bell, to adjourn the CIOC meeting. The motion carried by unanimous voice vote.

The Citizens’ Infrastructure Oversight Commission meeting adjourned 8:00 p.m.

The next regularly scheduled meeting of the Citizens’ Infrastructure Oversight Commission will be 6:30 p.m., August 14, 2019, in the Sarge Littlehale Community Room, 22 Orinda Way, Orinda, California.