

**CITY OF ORINDA  
CITIZENS' INFRASTRUCTURE OVERSIGHT COMMISSION  
MINUTES**

April 10, 2019

A REGULAR MEETING OF THE CITIZENS' INFRASTRUCTURE OVERSIGHT COMMISSION (CIOC) WAS HELD ON THE ABOVE DATE IN THE SARGE LITTLEHALE COMMUNITY ROOM, 22 ORINDA WAY, ORINDA, CALIFORNIA

**A. CALL TO ORDER**

Chair Hammon called the meeting to order at 6:35 p.m.

The following documents were provided at this meeting:

1. *Condition of Our Road Pavement Network / City of Orinda 20 Year Scenario Projections (after 2019 Project)* - by Director of Public Works and Engineering Services Theis, dated March 2019
2. *Executive Summary - 2018 PMP Update P-TAP Round 19 Final Report March 2019* - by Pavement Engineering, Inc., dated March 2019
3. *DRAFT - Residential Road Rehabilitation Program: Objectives, Expenditures, and Results to Date* - by Commissioners Condon, Murphy, and Nelson, dated April 10, 2019

**B. ROLL CALL**

COMMISSIONERS: Walter Bell, Jerry Condon , Chris Decareau (absent, unexcused), Jud Hammon, Bill Hurrell (late arrival), Terry Murphy, Richard Nelson

City Staff: Paving Program Project Manager Farah Khorashadi

**C. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE – led by Chair Hammon**

**D. ADOPTION OF AGENDA**

MOTION: By Commissioner Murphy, seconded by Commissioner Nelson, to adopt the agenda. The motion carried by unanimous voice vote.

**E. PUBLIC FORUM - None**

**F. CITIZENS' INFRASTRUCTURE OVERSIGHT COMMISSION MEETING MINUTES**

Approval of CIOC Meeting Minutes of March 13, 2019

MOTION: By Commissioner Murphy, seconded by Commissioner Condon, to approve the meeting minutes of March 13, 2019. The motion carried by unanimous voice vote.

**7:00 p.m. – Commissioner Hurrell arrived.**

**G. DISCUSSION – 2018 ROAD AND DRAINAGE REPAIRS PLAN AND NEXT STEPS - SUB-COMMITTEE PROGRESS REPORT**

Chair Hammon advised that the Sub-committee had not met since the last CIOC meeting; he asked Paving Program Project Manager Khorashadi to distribute the *Executive Summary of the 2018 PMP Updated for the P-TAP Report*; the P-TAP Report provides information which will be helpful in updating the Plan; although there is no drainage information in the P-TAP report, it does include several budget scenarios and offers insight on achieving objectives.

Commissioner Murphy commented that the Executive Summary was useful.

Commissioner Bell agreed with Chair Hammon and Commissioner Murphy and stated that the P-TAP Report is well done.

Commissioner Nelson concurred and encouraged the Commissioners to review the entire P-TAP Report, particularly the description of the treatment and decision tree and the causes of pavement deterioration. He noted that, while the report discusses *Optimum PCI* (Pavement Condition Index), it is not defined and suggested that a definition be included.

Paving Program Project Manager Khorashadi noted her understanding is that *Optimum PCI* is PCI 70 and above; in the StreetSaver program, a default for a PCI breakpoint of 70 is used to separate preventive maintenance versus rehabilitation; if the PCI 70 or greater, Streetsaver recommends preventative maintenance; if PCI is less than 70, Streetsaver is programmed for rehabilitation.

Commissioner Nelson thought that was an excellent description. He questioned what the goal was of the City Council or what goal the Commission has adopted; the updated Plan should have an objective and clearly stated goal; if the Commission wants to use the analysis in the P-TAP Report, then it should be based upon a set of objectives and a goal.

Commissioner Murphy stated that the P-TAP Report is well done and should be posted on the City website; the Executive Summary should also be posted separately on the website, as most residents will not read the entire document to find pertinent information. Regarding the City's goals, the CIOC began working on goals when the half-cent Sales Tax was approved - what to do with \$1 million per year, how to allocate the funds, and how to spend the monies on Residential roads; the goal shifted to repairing worst roads first and the most travelled streets; when the residents approved the Bond measure, the goal became achieving an average PCI of 70, with no roads under PCI 50. The CIOC's goals have changed and shifted and now it should be how to go forward so that the City does not end up in the same position 20 years from now; that is the goal the City Council should discuss. The CIOC can look at that and make recommendations to the City Council.

Chair Hammon advised that in November 2015, the City Council adopted the CIOC recommendation of average PCI 70 and no roads with PCI less than 50; on the PCI

projection graph, the orange line does not cross to below PCI 70 until 2038; many things can change in the interim that might affect those PCI projections, either by increasing or declining.

Commissioner Nelson stated that was just an *average* PCI; the focus was not on the average PCI, rather the minimum acceptable road condition; the CIOC can ask the City Council to define their objectives; budget scenarios for the current goal can be calculated and compared with the optimum budget scenario; perhaps there is no substantial difference; the Sub-committee may want to consider it when they are working on the update to the Road and Drainage Repairs Plan; he asked staff to run one more scenario and compare with it with optimum budget scenario. The issue of *Optimum PCI* should be explained to the City Council.

Commissioner Murphy stated that the Streetsaver program is a good tool; early on when funding was minimal, Streetsaver recommended spending monies on some roads and no funds on the roads most in need of repair; that was because the program was making maximum utilization of limited resources. It was then decided that approach was not how to go forward and it was determined to repair the worst roads first. The City has finally come to a point with the rehabilitation of the City roads wherein Streetsaver can inform on how and when to proceed, because none of the roads will be under PCI 50 and the average will be well above PCI 70; the program can now help in allocating the limited resources to receive maximum benefit. The question is how to get more resources because, based upon the available data, we need additional resources - not for major work but for adequate maintenance.

Commissioner Bell stated that pavement deterioration rate is very rapid when the PCI reaches 50 and below; the 20 year projection PCI graph is an excellent way to communicate with the public and the City Council.

Commissioner Condon stated that Page 6, Paragraph 1, of the Executive Summary explains why the costs for the first year are high - the first year costs are greater due to the fact that Streetsaver is addressing all the backlog maintenance.

Commissioner Nelson advised that the Sub-committee should consider including the City's plans for 2020 and 2021 with the available funds.

Chair Hammon concurred; he also recommended that the additional drainage information that will be provided by Senior Engineer Christie be included in the Plan.

This item was continued to the next CIOC meeting.

#### **H. DISCUSSION – MANAGEMENT REPORT ON INFRASTRUCTURE – SUB-COMMITTEE PROGRESS REPORT**

Commissioner Nelson reported that the Sub-committee had met and prepared the *DRAFT Residential Road Rehabilitation Program: Objectives, Expenditures, and Results to Date*,

which he distributed. The Draft document was reviewed by Director of Finance Rankin and City staff. He inquired if the Management Report is to be a CIOC report or the City's report.

Commissioner Murphy stated that the Management Report should come from the CIOC and be forwarded to the City Council; it is a communication tool to advise the public how and what the City has done with their tax dollars. He requested that staff revise the PCI projection graphs to show the PCI for year 2014; this will inform the public of the initial status of the roads and what has been accomplished with the funding since that time; additionally, there must be a mechanism to fund future maintenance or the roads will deteriorate again. The question for the public is do they want to face that again in 2039 - that can be the essence of the Management Report.

Commissioner Nelson stated the Management Report should focus on the results, not on the future; he recommended that the Commissioners review the Draft document and send their comments to Paving Program Project Manager Khorashadi so she can distribute; the Sub-committee can then amend per the comments and bring the Management Report back to the CIOC for final review and approval.

Commissioner Condon asked if staff can supply the missing information for the PCI segments at the bottom of the Draft.

Paving Program Project Manager Khorashadi advised that she has provided all the information that was available based upon the previous P-TAP reports.

Chair Hammon stated that information for the PCI segments is not available for all years and the Sub-committee should add a note explaining the reason.

The Commissioners decided to remove the *Grand Total* column from the Draft document.

Vice-Chair Hurrell commented that the Draft is good and a great deal of information is presented.

Chair Hammon stated the Draft is a good start and the Commissioners should send their comments to Paving Program Project Manager Khorashadi prior to the next meeting.

Commissioner Murphy will prepare a final draft of the Management Report and bring it back to the next month CIOC meeting for review and approval.

This item was continued to the next CIOC meeting.

**I. DISCUSSION – SCHEDULING /PLANNING MEETING WITH THE TRAFFIC SAFETY ADVISORY COMMITTEE (TSAC) AND THE PUBLIC WORKS AESTHETIC REVIEW COMMITTEE (PWARC) REGARDING FUTURE INFRASTRUCTURE IMPROVEMENTS**

This item was continued to the next CIOC meeting.

**J. STAFF UPDATES**

Paving Program Project Manager Khorashadi reported on the following items:

- *Update – Public Information and Outreach* - A Public Notice regarding the 2019 Pavement Rehabilitation Project was posted on Nextdoor and Outlook.
- *Update – 2018 Pavement Rehabilitation Project* – Bay Cities Paving and Grading is working to complete punch list items; rubberized asphalt was used on some of the roads last year; unfortunately the rubberized asphalt is raveling on several streets; staff met with the contractor on April 9, 2019, and requested a proposal to remedy the condition.
- *Update- 2019 Pavement Rehabilitation Project* – Following approval by the City Council on April 23, 2019, the project is scheduled to be advertised on April 24, 2019.

**K. MATTERS INITIATED**

Items for the next CIOC Agenda:

- Discussion - 2018 Road and Drainage Repairs Plan Status and Next Steps – Sub-Committee Progress Report
- Review and Approval – Management Report On Infrastructure – Final Draft
- Discussion – Scheduling/Planning for Meetings with the Traffic Safety Advisory Committee (TSAC) and the Public Works Aesthetic Review Committee (PWARC) Regarding Future Infrastructure Improvements

**L. ADJOURNMENT**

MOTION: By Commissioner Murphy, seconded by Commissioner Bell, to adjourn the CIOC meeting. The motion carried by unanimous voice vote.

The Citizens’ Infrastructure Oversight Commission meeting adjourned 8:20 p.m.

The next regularly scheduled meeting of the Citizens’ Infrastructure Oversight Commission will be 6:30 p.m., May 8, 2019, in the Sarge Littlehale Community Room, 22 Orinda Way, Orinda, California.